

“Who Created God?” is an Illegitimate and Impossible Question Based Upon Confusion Between Categories



The question: “If God is the Creator of everything, then who created God?” is illegitimate because by definition, the Creator is **uncreated**. He is eternal, without beginning, without end and all affairs return back to Him:

وَأَنَّ إِلَىٰ رَبِّكَ الْمُنْتَهَىٰ

“**And that to your Lord is the return** (of all beings and affairs) (and of all perfections in attributes).” (53:42).

Thus to ask who or what created something that is **uncreated** is the way of:

- a) an **ignorant person** devoid of intellect
- b) a lying deceiver, a **sophist**.

First: It is to treat the two categories of **created** and **uncreated** as being the same. To confuse categories is the way of ignorant people, such as the one who says “How many ounces is the temperature

today?” Ounces are a measurement of weight, not temperature. And the one who says: “Did John give birth to a boy or a girl?” Males do not and cannot give birth to children, only females do.

Second: It is to assert an endless chain of causative agents (creators), this is impossible, and hence the question is illegitimate.

Ibn Taymiyyah (رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ) said: “Because it is known through innate and necessary knowledge, to everyone from the offspring of Adam whose innate disposition is sound, that this is a corrupt question, and that it is impossible for there to be a creator of the Creator of all creation. For if He had a creator, then He would be created, He would not be a Creator for all of creation. Rather, He would be from the generality of the creation. But there must be a Creator for all of creation, this is known by necessity and innate disposition.”¹

Third: Alongside the above impossibility, it is to assert that **all existence (wujūd)** is created, originated and this is pure sophistry, no intelligent person claims this.² Rather, something has to be eternal and uncreated by necessity. It is either an uncreated creator with **knowledge, will, choice, power, wisdom** or it is an eternal universe to whose component matter these same attributes of will, choice, power, and wisdom are **covertly and cryptically** given by naturalist atheists. Innate disposition (fiṭrah), sensory perception (ḥiss), and basic reasoning (‘aql) upon elementary truths (badīhiyyāt) establish that there is **choice with intent** in this creation, establishing thereby that within existence there is an uncreated being possessing those attributes, and which is other than the universe itself.

¹ Refer to Dar’ al-Ta’āruḍ (3/313-315).

² This is because something created **by nothing**, or something **creating itself** are impossibilities. Refer to Qur’ān (52:35).

Fourth: For this reason, it is binding upon atheists to assert that the universe is eternal, to assert that there is a “necessary existence” which is the universe, and this is the way of Fir‘aun and pure atheists. The statement that **everything in existence is originated, created** and that this entire originated existence is **not in need** of something other than it is not said by anyone with intelligence and is not related as the saying of any well-known faction. Ibn Taymiyyah explained that a person who asserts this is a sophist who has corruption in his intellect and he stated: “For this reason, it is not known from a nation among the nations that they spoke of the origination of the universe without an originator”.³ In other words, there can only be two views. Either the entire universe is eternal and has always been there, or the universe was originated, created by an uncreated creator who is eternal and to whom all affairs return. And reflection upon the universe itself and what it contains of ḥikām and ghāyāt (wisdoms, end-goals, intricate, intertwined cause-effect systems, goal-steering mechanisms and so on) establishes that the latter is true. This is known by innate disposition, sensory perception and basic reason. The routes to establishing this are many and the Qur‘ān has indicated them. But no faction—apart from isolated sophists with corrupt intellects—has asserted that **everything in existence** is created, originated.

Fifth: Given the above, this question is illegitimate for both views. In other words, if an atheist asserts the universe is eternal, has always been there, uncreated, then to him, it would be illegitimate to ask the question: “If the universe is eternal, uncreated, then who created it?” Hence, for an atheist to ask this question: “If God created everything, then who created God?”, this is nonsensical, and it is a

³ Majmū‘ al-Fatāwā (13/150-151).

form of sophistry. As for the evidence that within all of existence, there is that which is created, and that which is uncreated, eternal then that is firmly established through **fiṭrah** (innate disposition), **ḥiss** (sensory perception), **mushāhadah** (observation), **‘aql ṣarīḥ** (sound reason) based upon **badīhiyyāt** (elementary truths), revealed books and sent messengers. As such—since this is nothing but a whisper, a doubt, which is based upon sophistry—when this question arises, the Prophet (صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ) simply advised that a person make isti‘ādḥah and desist.⁴ Abū Hurayrah relates that the Messenger of Allāh (صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ) said: “They will not cease to ask you O Abu Hurayrah until they say: ‘This is Allāh, so who created Allāh?’” So while he was in the mosque, some bedouin people came and said: “O Abu Hurayrah, this is Allāh, so who created Allāh?” Abu Hurayrah took some pebbles and threw them at them, saying: “Get up, get up, my friend— [the Messenger]—spoke the truth.”⁵ So the way to treat this answer:

- a) Through isti‘ādḥah and desisting, repelling.
- b) Through evidence, as has been outlined.
- c) Through affirmation of īmān.

And all routes are commanded as indicated by Ibn Taymiyyah.⁶

So one may simply affirm his īmān to repel the doubt, and this way is fine, and one may make isti‘ādḥah and repel the idea and this is fine, and one may repel it through evidences, and this is fine. And one may use all approaches because there is nothing in this doubt at all, it is illegitimate and impossible.

Abu ‘Iyaad

<http://aboutatheism.net>

⁴ In numerous ḥadīths, refer to Muslim (no. 343, 344, 345, 351).

⁵ Related by Muslim (no. 349).

⁶ Refer to Dar’ al-Ta‘āruḍ (3/308-309).

22 Dhū al-Qa'dah 1440 / 25 July 2019 - v.1.05